Subtitles in Translators' Training: A Model of Analysis

Laura Incalcaterra McLoughlin

National University of Ireland, Galway, Republic of Ireland

Research on the pedagogical implications of the use of subtitling in language teaching has traditionally focused mainly on the effects of ready-captioned material on learners' reading and listening abilities and, less often, on oral skills. In recent years, a number of contributions have also explored the usefulness of audiovisual translation in foreign language curricula and an increasing number of translator training degree courses across Europe now include subtitling modules. This article first considers the use of subtitling in language teaching and then explores in more detail its use so far in translators' training. It then looks at the introduction of subtitle creation in translation classes, reflecting on the linguistic, semantic, and cultural issues involved, and proposes a model of analysis for pedagogical purposes. Finally it presents the results of a trial conducted in the Department of Italian at National University of Ireland, Galway, during the academic year 2006–2007, showing how a structured approach to subtitle creation based on this model contributes to enhancing advanced students' translation competence.

KEYWORDS Subtitling, translation, audiovisual, language teaching, translation education

As interest in multimediality grows and the field of audiovisual translation becomes more and more topical in our society, research on subtitling, in particular, is becoming quite extensive.[1] Research on the pedagogical implications of the use of subtitling in language teaching, however, has traditionally focused mainly on the effects of ready-captioned material on learners' reading and listening abilities and, less often, on oral skills. In recent years, a number of contributions have also explored the usefulness of audiovisual translation in foreign language curricula and an increasing number of translator training degree courses across Europe now include subtitling modules. In this paper I will consider the use of subtitling first and, briefly, in language teaching, and I will then explore in more detail its use so far in translators' training. I will then clarify my perspective with regard to the introduction of subtitle creation in translation classes, reflecting on the linguistic, semantic, and cultural

issues involved, and propose a model of analysis for pedagogical purposes. Finally I will present a trial conducted in the Department of Italian of National University of Ireland, Galway, during the academic year 2006–2007 and will show how a structured approach to subtitle creation based on this model contributes to enhance advanced students' translation competence.

Subtitles in foreign language classes

Experiments with the use of ready-captioned material in the foreign language class go back at least to the early 1980s when a study carried out at Harvard University by Price and Dow involving foreign students of ESL concluded that intralingual (or same-language) captions significantly improve linguistic and cultural comprehension.[2] Since then, the use of captioned video in FL classes has been evaluated in several studies involving different languages and data collected strongly support such approach.[3] Thomas Garza's research with advanced learners of English and Russian shows 'a positive correlation between the presence of captions and increased comprehension of the linguistic content of the video material'.[4]

Whilst most research has concentrated on the effects of captions and subtitles on learners' reading and comprehension skills, Borrás and Lafayette investigated their usefulness with respect to enhancement of speaking skills and found that 'intralingual subtitles have potential value in helping the learner to not only better comprehend authentic linguistic input but also to produce comprehensible communicative output'.[5]

The positive effect of intra- and interlingual captions and subtitles on FL learners is explained by the combination of aural, visual, and written elements in multimedia, and the opportunity this combination offers for noticing speech acts which can then be internalized through task-based and other specifically designed activities. Users of subtitles in foreign language classes tend to agree that they allow language to be noticed, a key requirement for acquisition. Recent research has taken subtitles even further in FL didactics, with incorporation of their production in FL classes. Software programmes like Learning via Subtitling (LvS), developed by a consortium of third-level institutions coordinated by the Hellenic Open University, answer the need to bring subtitles into FL teaching.[6] LvS is a language learning tool and, as such, it differs from professional or semi-professional subtitling software programmes in a number of ways, most notably in that it allows for provision of feedback from both students and teachers. I have shown elsewhere that creation of subtitles in FL learning is a translation process which encourages critical and reflective thinking:[7] linking two separate verbal systems (that of the Source Text and that of the Target Text) to the same visual input and implying a shift from the oral to the written code, subtitling encourages both contrastive awareness and retention because of the amount of processing required and because it involves both the visual and the verbal codes. In the case of intermediate/beginner learners in particular (B2 and below),[8] the involvement of the two codes has cognitive implications in accordance with Paivio's dual-coding theory. Paivio explains cognition as a process of dynamic associations of verbal and non-verbal representations. He postulates the existence of two independent systems which make up human cognition: the verbal — which deals with and stores

linguistic information — and the non-verbal — which deals with and stores imagery. Associations and interrelations between the two create a dual-coding situation which enhances memory.[9]

In advanced learners (C1 and above), code shifting and syntactical restructuring in subtitling lead to 'contrastive knowledge'[10] and 'contrastive analysis'[11] and improved understanding of the translation process.

Production of subtitles in translators' training

As subtitling is introduced in translators' training courses, research on the subject has increased. A number of ad hoc and semi-professional software programmes have been developed or adapted and results evaluated. The general consensus is that subtitling provides motivating and stimulating activities and the opportunity to reflect on the translation process and on the strategies employed. Having experimented with production of subtitles into FL, Christopher Rundle comments:

> I feel it is important when teaching subtitles into the foreign language not to place an excessive importance on the correctness of the students' work, and to use the exercise as an opportunity for students to experiment without fear of making mistakes so that they can then evaluate the success of their *strategies*.[12]

The relevance of subtitling to the acquisition of translation skills is justified by the notion that it creates a stage, a pause for reflection. It allows, even forces, learners to think about language and, in the case of students of translation, this means that a mental model of the process is being — rudimentally and perhaps subconsciously — formed. My objectives in the use of subtitles in translators' training are therefore fine-tuning of translation skills, development of critical thinking, learning to take distance from word per word translation, concentration on semantic units.

Trying to identify best practice for the introduction of subtitles in advanced translation classes, I decided to follow Christopher Taylor's system for multimodal transcription,[13] which in turn is based on Thibault's grid.[14] Multimodal transcription provides a methodology for the deconstruction of audiovisual texts, which are broken down into single frames of varying length and analysed frame by frame according to a number of semiotic descriptors. The length the still frames can stretch to depends on the type of audiovisual text being analysed, with slow-moving documentaries, for example, allowing for longer stills. This frame-by-frame analysis is then built into a more comprehensive study of shots and phases/subphases of the text.[15]

This methodological tool for filmic analysis is particularly useful when applied to subtitling in an educational context, because 'a study of the multimodal text in its entirety provides a basis for making reasoned choices in translating the verbal element of the text'.[16] Professional subtitlers seldom have the time to carry out such an in-depth analysis of the text, but in advanced translation classes it helps students to appreciate the multidimensional nature of film language and the several signifying codes it relies on in order to convey meaning. In turn, this leads them to consider the communication act as a whole rather than concentrating on single words or items. Indeed, following Halliday's functional theory,[17] Thibault's grid includes a column for metafunctional interpretation,[18] which, incorporated in a translation course, can

offer a structure for reflection not only on how meaning is created and developed in the film, but also on how the translation reflects such creation and development.

Taylor's grid for multimodal transcription is a slightly reduced version of Thibauld's and is extremely effective in class contexts. Taylor breaks down the analysis of each frame into four key elements and replaces the metafunctional column with a column for subtitles 'based on a global interpretation of all the semiotic modalities present in the text':[19]

- Visual image
- Kinesic action
- Soundtrack
- Subtitle.

Visual image includes camera position (CP), horizontal/vertical perspective (HP/ VP), visual focus (VF), distance of shot (D), visually salient items (VS), visual collocation (VC), colours (CR), and coding orientation (CO, for example natural versus dream-like or surreal frames).

During my own trial, I further simplified the grid, because of time constraints within my pilot course and also so as not to overload students. I must stress, however, that my simplification was dictated purely by practical considerations. I decided to dispense with perspective, distance, and colours. These elements are, of course, important constituents of meaning as they can carry strong cultural orientation. Colours in particular are often culture-specific and research on their presence in films and how they impact on audiovisual translation would be extremely interesting. I decided instead to include a 'reflection' column in the grid, which serves as space for observations on the adequacy of the proposed subtitles, in terms of adherence to the development of meaning in the source audiovisual text (SaT) and for other comments (although, in practice, this was done mainly orally because of lack of time). This proved to be a good solution for a course primarily designed to enhance translation competence.

The process was divided into three phases:

1) deconstruction of the semantic structure of SaT;
2) reconstruction of the semantic structure of SaT through FL subtitles;
3) analysis of phase 2.

While the first and second phase were based on a simplification of Taylor's grid, as outlined, the third phase adapts Frederic Chaume's 'framework of analysis based on signifying codes of film language'.[20] The semantic web of an audiovisual text is made up of a number of different signifying codes, of which, as Chuame observes, only the linguistic code can be manipulated by the translator. Understanding of these codes, however, allows translators to reflect critically on translation strategies and choices. From a didactic perspective, I found this to be a very useful step in self-evaluation and peer-evaluation of subtitles created.

Chaume identifies the following ten codes that impact on the translation of the audiovisual text and shows their relevance to dubbing and, where appropriate, to subtitling. They are: linguistic, paralinguistic, musical mode and special effects, sound arrangement, iconographic, photographic, planning, mobility, graphic, syntactic. Again, I simplified Chaume's framework and asked students to concentrate on issues

relating to the linguistic, paralinguistic (i.e. volume of voice, pauses, etc.), icono-graphic (particularly images not mentioned in the dialogue but important for trans-mission of meaning), and mobility code (i.e. proxemic and kinetic elements which could determine, for example, whose lines are subtitled first when many characters are speaking at once), which, I felt, have a more immediate impact on subtitling.[21] Not all codes were analysed in all scenes, however the availability of a reference grid served to sensitize students to aspects which may otherwise be overlooked.

In the end the three-phased model appeared as follows:

TABLE 1

	Phase 1		Phase 2	Phase 3
Visual input (CP, VF, VS, VC)	Kinesic action	Soundtrack (including dialogue)	Subtitles	Reflection:
				linguistic code
				paralinguistic code
				musical code
				iconographic code
				mobility code

The pilot course was run in 2006–2007 and it involved seven students, native speakers of either English or Italian, level C1–C2. The trial was then repeated in 2007–2008, but with only two students, both native speakers of English and with a C1 level of Italian. I am reporting here on work done in 2006–2007.

We started with the opening scene from an Italian film by Gabriele Salvatores: *Nirvana*, 2000.[22] This scene is a monologue by an off-campus voice. The text was translated in class. Subsequently, the translated text was entered into a software pro-gramme and synchronized with the video material. A total of ten contact hours were dedicated to this project, although the students also worked independently outside class hours. The aim of this short course was not, obviously, to train professional subtitlers, but to improve translation skills in advanced language learners. Less emphasis was therefore put on exact synchronization of text and other technical aspects than would otherwise be necessary. I was interested in whether aspects of the subtitling process could be significant for translator training and how the awareness of these aspects could impact on a trainee translator's performance.

A number of semi-professional subtitling tools are freely available on the Internet and are extremely useful in class situations, as professional tools are quite expensive. At the time of writing, at least two easy-to-use freeware subtitle creators are available: DivXLand Media Subtitler by DivXLand[23] and Subtitle Workshop by URUworks,[24] both compatible with a number of video file formats. I particularly like the clarity of interface in DivXLand Media Subtitler, so in class we used this software. We created a .txt file with the translated script and then imported it into the Subtitler. Line breaks can be added and the finished product is quite professional. Subtitles were not actu-ally embedded into the film, in the sense that no DVD was created containing a copy of the film and our subtitles. DivXLand allows viewing of the finished product in

'preview mode', where subtitles and video are only temporarily shown together but the two entities remain separate.[25]

Since all students were new to this technique, we began with a straightforward, non-professional tool, included in the Sanako multimedia language laboratory package.[26] Lines of text are typed in a window on the screen and synchronized by clicking on start/end time or by manually entering the time value.

Subtitles created appear in a yellow, intrusive area at the bottom of the screen and lines cannot be centred or realigned in any way. In order to split the text into two lines it was necessary to enter manually enough spaces for the text to roll onto the second line.

However basic, this system proved to be a very good starting point and a gentle introduction to the complexities of the subtitling process. The ease of use allowed students to concentrate on text analysis and translation issues rather than exact synchronization. It was immediately obvious that several captions were too long and a degree of syntactical restructuring was necessary in order for the subtitled text to coincide with the characters' mouth articulation (one of the mobility codes listed by Chaume). The length of the caption is of course inversely proportional to the speed of the audio. When the voice picked up speed, and when dialogues involved overlapping lines, the necessity for such restructuring became increasingly more obvious and more challenging. This initial exercise also highlighted the importance of paralinguistic codes in the translation of audiovisual texts: the fixed font did not allow students to indicate that the voice was off-campus by means of typographical conventions (the use of italics, for example), which students were very quick to point out during both trials.

Following this 'warm-up' exercise and moving on to the use of DivXLand Media Subtitler, students were introduced to *Aprile*, by Nanni Moretti (1998), a film about Moretti himself trying to make a documentary on the political campaign for the 1996 Italian general elections, while being constantly distracted by the imminent birth of his son. The film is interspersed with cultural references, as political parties and personalities are seen and heard on television and continued reference is made to Italian political life and history. Translating humour and other culture-specific elements in an environment where explanatory notes are not an option presented a major challenge, but the multimedial transcription grid offered support. For example, in *Aprile*, as the country prepares for the 1996 elections, Moretti decides to film a demonstration commemorating Italy's liberation from Fascism. The musical code immediately clarifies for Italian audiences the political connotation of the demonstration, as the crowd chant 'bandiera nera votiamo no. Bandiera rossa votiamo sì' (literally: we shall not vote for the black flag, we shall vote for the red flag). Flagging the musical code in the reflection column alerted students to the need to introduce subtitles in the frame. Italics were used to diversify from dialogue: *Black flag, no. Red flag, yes.*

In another scene, the camera focuses on a close-up of Moretti buying a disproportionate number of magazines and newspapers for his research in preparation for the documentary he will never finish. Most of the publications will be well known to Italian audiences, who would detect humour in the range and diversity of the titles

requested. In addition, the opening words 'Salve. Salute. Come stai?' give the impression that Moretti is actually greeting somebody, while he is in fact just asking for magazines at a newspaper kiosk. Reflecting on the linguistic code, students decided that the titles should be left in Italian and that the comic effect would still be conveyed by the shift in camera angle, detected in Phase 1 under VF and VS, which abandons the close-up and moves behind Moretti, showing the number of magazines he is piling up under his arm. Some students also commented that foreign audiences are likely to recognize 'salute' and possibly even 'come stai?' and therefore appreciate the play on words at the beginning of the scene. Chaume observes that a model of analysis

> Should have the objective of focusing the object under study by using systematic approaches [...]. Furthermore, if we wish the model to be useful in the teaching of translation, it should be able to a) show translators the tools (translation strategies and techniques) with which they will be able to confront their task, and b) *reduce to a minimum the need for improvisation*, but not for creativity.[27]

In this case, study of the camera angle in the deconstruction phase allowed students to make an informed decision on how to deal with culture-specific humour. A similar decision was reached in the scene that follows, rich in iconographic codes. Moretti has cut clippings from all the newspapers and magazines he has just bought and has covered the entire floor of a rather large room with them. Some titles are clearly legible. However, students decided that they were not carrying meaning linked to the dialogue or to the development of the plot and left them untranslated, thereby consciously avoiding that domestication of otherness so common in subtitling (and often present in other forms of translation, too). Decisions were therefore made on the basis of analysis of extralinguistic elements and their contribution to the meaning of the scene, which became clear with the use of the grid. In addition, it was considered that a putative audience would be made up of adult viewers residing in Ireland with an interest in Italy and Italian culture.

As the film progresses, Moretti becomes less and less interested in the political documentary and more and more immersed in his own family life, which he has difficulty separating from his professional commitments. His relationship with other family members (his wife, his mother, and, eventually, his son) forms a thick subplot, parallel in importance to the main storyline. Sitting at their kitchen table, Moretti and his wife, Silvia, spend much time trying to decide a name for the new baby and, as they work at restricting the list of possible names, the phone rings and Moretti's mother is on the line. The scene that follows is a truly delightful domestic cameo. I report hereafter the analysis done in class.

The scene clip is 2.09 minutes long. We imported into Windows Movie Maker,[28] which automatically divided it into eleven clips (visual input) of varying duration, ranging from two to twenty-four seconds. We further divided longer clips into two or three shorter ones. In his multimodal transcription analysis of *La vita è bella*, Taylor breaks down a scene from the film to one-second frames.[29] Whilst this makes for a much more accurate analysis of the SaT, I found that in a course of this type longer AV input was acceptable and, in fact, worked quite well. An example is given in Table 2 below.

TABLE 2

Visual input	Phase 1		Phase 2	Phase 3
	Kinesic action	Soundtrack	subtitles	Reflection
CP: static VF: Moretti>wife VS: Moretti, telephone. VC: home, kitchen	Moretti looks away from wife	(Moretti) Niente, Silvia dice Al Pacino diventa sempre più bello …	No, nothing. Silvia says Pacino gets more and more handsome …	linguistic code: in Italian Al Pacino, in English Pacino is enough paralinguistic code: insertion of 3 dots to indicate pause musical code: absent iconographic code: no interference with dialogue. mobility code: Moretti switches from talking on the phone to his mother and talking to his wife
CP: static VF: Moretti>wife VS: Moretti, telephone VC: home, kitchen	Moretti turns to looks at his wife	e sempre più basso.	and shorter and shorter.	linguistic code: humour / resentment paralinguistic code musical code iconographic code mobility code

Table 3 gives the full script for this scene with the corresponding subtitles. The rough alignment of the two texts is only intended for ease of reference and the names of the characters do not, of course, appear in the subtitles. I have indicated with a line break the start of a new subtitled clip.

Hatim and Mason remark that the subtitler is often required to make difficult choices which can result in some loss of meaning in favour of coherence and readability of the text.[30] In a pedagogical context, the availability of a model of analysis helps students to reflect on these choices and consider just how much meaning it is appropriate to lose and indeed if it is appropriate to lose any at all. Students reflected on simplification of syntax and lexicon and wrote their remarks in the reflection column: 'in Italian Al Pacino, in English Pacino is enough' (Table 2). The model also helped students to decide how much non-linguistic signifying codes contribute to the delivery of meaning and how they aid comprehension therefore reducing the need for domestication of the linguistic code. In addition, analysis of the kinesic elements helped to focus on the coherence between visual input and subtitles.

Nornes observes that 'the peculiar challenges posed by subtitles [. . .] are variations of the difficulties in any translation, and in a sense are analogous to the problems confronted by the translator of poetry'.[31] In this perspective, the inclusion of subtitling in translators' training aids critical understanding of the translation process, provides criteria of analysis and links that analysis to translations strategies. Further research is certainly necessary. The nature of the trial, block teaching over five weeks, limited the scope of the experiment. In particular, lack of familiarity with the

TABLE 3

Italian script	Subtitles
Silvia: Mario Sergio Alberto Mauro Fabrizio abbiamo detto di no. Matteo?	Silvia: Mario, Sergio, Alberto, Fabrizio, Mauro, Roberto, we said no. Matteo?
Moretti: Matteo bello. Silvia: Vero?	Moretti: Matteo. Nice one. Silvia: Yes?
Moretti: Sì. Silvia: Suona bene poi, è un nome carino.	Moretti: Yes. Silvia: And it sounds nice.
Moretti: Matteo Moretti. Matteo, Tommaso, un po' di moda in questi anni, eh? Silvia: Forse un po'.	Moretti: Matteo Moretti. Matteo, Tommaso … rather fashionable lately, no? Silvia: Yeah, a bit.
Moretti: Molto usati. No. Fabio?	Moretti: Too common. No. Fabio?
Silvia: Semplice. Moretti: Semplice.	Silvia: Yes, simple. Moretti: Simple.
Fabia era più bello. Se era una bambina. Non si sono sbagliati con le analisi … No perché mi hanno che a volte dicono che è un bambino e invece è una bambina.	Fabia is nicer. Yes, if it's a girl … They didn't get it wrong, did they? Sometimes they say it's a boy and it's a girl.
Silvia: No. è il contrario. È una bambina … A volte dicono che è una bambina e invece è un bambino. Silvia: Amos?	Silvia: No, the other way round: they say it's a girl and it's a boy. Silvia: Amos?
Moretti: Va bene. Amos. Federico? Federico.	Moretti: Amos. Federico.
Silvia: Mmm, Importante.	Silvia: Important …
Moretti: Sì, serio, importante. Forse troppo importante.	Moretti: Yeah, serious, important. Maybe too important.
Silvia: Un po' da grande.	Silvia: More of a grown-up name.
Moretti: Beh, prima o poi crescerà. Comunque va bene, niente Federico. Giovanni come me?	Moretti: He'll grow up eventually, no? Oh, ok then, not Federico. Giovanni like me?
Silvia: No. Moretti: Sì. Silvia: Non possiamo. Moretti: Non possiamo! Non vogliamo. Non è che.	Silvia: No, we can't. Moretti: We can't! We don't want to. It's not that …
Silvia: No no. È vietato. Vietato dalla legge. Moretti: È vietato dalla legge? Silvia: Certo. Moretti: Se era Giovanna … Se era una bambina magari Giovanna andava bene. Sì? Uh mamma, ciao.	Silvia: No, no, it's forbidden by law. Moretti: By law! Giovanna, if it's a girl maybe Giovanna. Yes … Oh mum, Hi.

TABLE 3
(CONTINUED)

Italian script	Subtitles
Sì. No, no, abbiamo finito di mangiare. Abbiamo finito anche le eliminatorie … Silvia: Simone, Simone?	Yes, no no, we've just finished eating … and we've finished the first round … Silvia: Simone, Simone?
Moretti: Simone? Chiedo a mia mamma che ne pensa? Silvia: No. Moretti: No? Decidiamo noi? Simone, va bene Simone. Eh niente, abbiamo finito le eliminatorie e siamo ai quarti di finale. Sì. Sì, siamo andati ieri sera. Heat, com'era Heat. Così, sai, è l'incontro tra un poliziotto e un criminale. Il criminale ha appena ammazzato 300 persone e poi incontra il poliziotto che lo insegue e si dicono vabbè, in fondo siamo un po' uguali, amiamo tutti e due molto il nostro mestiere e sai, il bene, il male, due facce della stessa medaglia … Com'erano gli attori, dice mamma. De Niro, Al Pacino com'erano?	Moretti: Simone? Shall I ask my mum what she thinks? No? We'll decide ourselves? Simone, alright, Simone. Nothing, we're at the quarter-finals now. Yes, we went last night. Heat, what was Heat like? Well, you know, the meeting between a cop and a crimina … the criminal has just killed 300 people and then … meets the cop chasing him and they say … well, deep down we're pretty much the same … we both love our jobs … you know … good, evil, two sides of the coin. What were the actors like, mum says. De Niro, Al Pacino, what were they like?
Silvia: Al Pacino è sempre più bello. Moretti: Che c'entra scusa? Silvia: Eh, c'entra.	Silvia: Pacino gets more and more handsome. Moretti: And what does that matter? Silvia: It matters.
Moretti: Sto parlando dei personaggi, del senso, della struttura del film. Uhm, vabbè. Niente, Silvia dice Al Pacino diventa sempre più bello … e sempre più basso. Sì. Va bene, ci sentiamo stasera. Ciao mammì, ciao.	Moretti: I am talking about characters, meaning, structure of the film. No, nothing. Silvia says Pacino gets more and more handsome … and shorter and shorter. Yeah, OK. Talk to you later. Bye mummy! Bye.

software meant that perhaps too much time was spent solving technical difficulties and not enough time was left for analyses of other important aspects of the subtitling process and its product, such as retaining cohesion and coherence. Nevertheless, I feel the trial indicates that the structured use of subtitling in translators' training can yield very positive results because, when used in conjunction with a multimodal transcription system, it clarifies the often elusive facets of meaning and, by requiring explicit detailed analysis of a multi-semiotic text, it enhances the five types of knowledge identified by Bell as making up translation competence: SL knowledge, text-related knowledge, TL knowledge, real-world knowledge, and contrastive knowledge.[32]

Notes

[1] In 2002, *RILA, Rassegna italiana di linguistica applicata* published a double issue dedicated to the proceedings of the conference 'Cinema: paradiso delle lingue. I sottotitoli nell'apprendimento linguistico', Pavia, 19–21 September 2001. Articulated into three sections, the publication covers topics such as translation through subtitles, the use and role of subtitles in foreign language classes and Henrik Gottlieb's extensive bibliography on subtitling: 'Titles on Subtitling 1929–1999. An International Annotated Bibliography: Interlingual Subtitling for Cinema, TV, Video and DVD', *RILA — Rassegna Italiana di Linguistica Applicata*, 34:1–2 (2002), 215–397. Of particular significance for this article: Henrik Gottlieb, 'Subtitling. A New University Discipline', *Teaching Translation and Interpreting*, ed. by Cay Dollerup et al. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. 161–170; 'Subtitling: Diagonal Translation', *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 1 (1994), 101–22; *(Multi)media Translation. Concepts, practices and research*, ed. by Yves Gambier and Henrik Gottlieb (Amsterdam and London: Benjamin, 2001); Jorge Diaz-Cintas, 'In Search of a Theoretical Framework for the Study of Audiovisual Translation', *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*, ed. by Pilar Orero (Amsterdam and London: Benjamin, 2004), 21–33; Elisa Perego, 'Evidence of Explicitation in Subtitling. Towards a Categorisation', *Across Languages and Cultures*, 4:1 (2003), 63–88; *La traduzione audiovisiva* (Rome: Carocci, 2005).

[2] Karen Price, 'Closed-Captioned TV: An Untapped Resource', *MATSOL Newsletter*, 12:2 (1983), 1–8.

[3] See, for example, Thomas Garza, 'Evaluating the Use of Captioned Video Materials in Advanced Foreign Language Learning', *Foreign Language Annuals*, 24:3 (1991), 239–59; Isabel Borrás and Robert C. Lafayette, 'Effects of Multimedia Courseware Subtitling on the Speaking Performance of College Students of French', *The Modern Language Journal*, 78:1 (1994), 61–75; Helen Williams and David Thorne, 'The Value of Teletext Subtitling as a Medium for Language Learning, *System*, 28 (2000), 218–28; Noa Talaván Zanón, 'Using Subtitles to Enhance Foreign Language Learning', *Porta linguarum*, 6 (2006), 41–52.

[4] Garza, 1991: 239.

[5] Borrás and Lafayette, 1994: 69.

[6] <http://levis.cti.gr/> [accessed 23 April 2008]. An analytical overview of LvS can be found in Stravroula Sokoli, 'Learning via Subtitling (LvS). A Tool for the Creation of Foreign Language Learning Activities based on Film Subtitling', in *Multidimensional Translation: Audiovisual Translation Scenarios*, ed. by Mary Carroll, Heidrun Gerzymisch-Arbogast, and Sandra Nauert (Saarbrücken: ATRC, 2007), 66–73.

[7] Laura Incalcaterra McLoughlin, *Inter-semiotic Translation in Foreign Language Acquisition. The Case of Subtitles* (in print).

[8] Descriptor codes for FL proficiency are taken from the *Common European Framework of Reference*, which identifies three level: A for basic users, B for independent users, and C for proficient users of the FL. Each level is then further divided into two sub-levels (A1, A2, B1, etc.). The full text of the CEFR is available on http://www.coe.int/T/DG4/Linguistic/Source/Framework_EN.pdf [accessed 20 October 2008].

[9] Allan Paivio, 'Mental Imagery in Associative Learning and Memory', *Psychological Review*, 76:3 (1969), 241–63; *Mental Representations: a Dual Coding Approach* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986).

[10] Roger Bell, *Translation and Translating* (London: Longman, 1991).

[11] Faber advocates the need for contrastive analysis 'done by pupils as FL learners themselves, to gain linguistic awareness of the contrasts and similarities holding between the structure of the MT [mother tongue] and the FL. This variety of CA, then, does not mean a detailed contrastive study, but rather activities which develop an awareness in students of patterns of meaning common to many languages'. Pamela Faber, 'Translation Competence and Language Awareness', *Language Awareness*, 7:1 (1998), 9–21 (9).

[12] Christopher Rundle, 'Using Subtitles to Teach Translation', in *La traduzione multimediale: Quale traduzione per quale testo?*, ed. by Rosa Maria Bollettieri Bosinelli, Christina Heiss, and Marcello Soffritti (Bologna: CLUEB, 2000), pp. 167–81 (168).

[13] Christopher Taylor, 'Multimodal Transcription in the Analysis, Translation and Subtitling of Italian Films', *The Translator*, 9:2 (2003), 191–205.

[14] Paul Thibault, 'The Multimodal Transcription of a Television Advertisement: Theory and Practice', in *Multimodality and Multimediality in the Distance Learning Age* (Campobasso: Palladino Editore, 2000), pp. 311–85.

[15] Anthony Baldry and Paul Thibault, *Multimodal Transcription and Text Analysis* (London: Equinox, 2005), Appendix I, i–xii (i).

[16] Taylor, 2003: 192.

[17] Halliday's functional theory identifies the following metafunctions of the semiotic modes: experiential, interpersonal, textual and logical. M. A. K. Halliday, 'Modes of Meaning and Modes of Expressions: Types of Grammatical Structure and their Determination by Different Semantic Functions', *Functions and Context in Linguistic Analysis: A Festschrift for William Hass*, ed. by David J. Allerton, Edward

Carney, and David Holdcroft (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), pp. 57–59.

[18] 'The purpose of the metafunctional column is to suggest some of the ways in which the multimodal integration of the metafunctions is achieved. Each metafunction is identified as follows: EXP=*experiental*; INT=*interpersonal*; TEX= *textual*; LOG=*logical*'; Baldry and Thibault, 2005: 222.

[19] Ibid., p. 194. With reference to the 'semiotic modalities' mentioned here by Taylor, a seminal work on the analysis of visual images and their semiotics in Western culture is Gunther Kress and Theo van Leeuwen, *Reading Images. The Grammar of Visual Design* (London and New York: Routledge, 2006: 2nd revised edn. 1st edn, 1996).

[20] Frederic Chaume, 'Film Studies and Translation Studies: Two Disciplines at Stake in Audiovisual Translation', *META*, 49:1 (2004), 12–24 (16).

[21] The time allocated to this project was too short to allow for a more thorough analysis of the audio-visual text. Chaume's article shows that the signifying codes he identifies impact on the translation of AV texts both in dubbing and in subtitling and they should, therefore, all be considered.

[22] In the case of each film, scenes were no more than three minutes long. They were used exclusively for didactic purposes and the finished subtitled video was not stored or published anywhere.

[23] <http://divxland.org> [accessed 15 October 2008].

[24] <http://uruworks.net> [accessed 15 October 2008].

[25] To avoid copyright issues, a considerable number of films now in the public domain can be legally downloaded from the internet. A number of sites offer a wide variety of titles: <http://www.public-domainflicks.com>, <http://www.archive.org/details/movies>, <http://emol.org/movies> [accessed 16 October 2008]. I am currently working with *Detour*, an interesting 1945 public-domain *noir* by Edgar G. Ulmer.

[26] Sanako Lab 300 is not freeware, but a multimedia language laboratory package developed by Sanako. <www.sanako.com> [accessed 15 October 2008].

[27] Chaume, 2004: 13; my italics.

[28] Windows Movie Maker, by Microsoft, is part of most Windows packages or can be downloaded from www.microsoft.com. This programmes allows easy cutting and editing of video material. It is compatible with a number of different video formats.

[29] Taylor, 2003: 195.

[30] Basil Hatim and Ian Mason, 'Politeness in Screen Translating', in *The Translation Studies Reader*, ed. by Lawrence Venuti (London and New York: Routledge, 2000), 430–45 (435).

[31] Abé Mark Nornes, 'For an Abusive Subtitling', *Film Quarterly*, 52:3 (1999), 17–34 (18).

[32] Roger Bell, 1991: 36.

Note on Contributor

Correspondence to: Laura Incalcaterra McLoughlin, School of Languages, Literature and Cultures, National University of Ireland, Galway, University Road, Galway, Ireland. Email: laura.mcloughlin@nuigalway.ie